

Worksheet 8

NARRATIVE COUNTERARGUMENT MODEL

A dialogue between two teachers takes place in three steps. The students decide after each step which of the two wins the debate.

Steps:

A) *Speaker 1:*

“Bananas are better than oranges because they contain more potassium!”

Speaker 2:

“You say that bananas are better than oranges. But I disagree: oranges are better than bananas!”

Who would win this debate? Why?

B) *Speaker 1:*

“Bananas are better than oranges because they contain more potassium!”

Speaker 2:

“You say that bananas are better than oranges. But I disagree: oranges are better than bananas because they contain more vitamin C!”

Who would win this debate? Why?

C) *Speaker 1:*

“Bananas are better than oranges because they contain more potassium!”

Speaker 2:

“You say that bananas are better than oranges. But I disagree: oranges are better than bananas because they contain more vitamin C. My argument is stronger than yours because many foods contain potassium, but few contain a good amount of vitamin C. Therefore you should prefer oranges!”

Who would win this debate? Why?